GO Green Research and Education

Journal of Business and Management Research
ISSN:2958-5074 pISSN:2958-5066
Volume No:3 Issue No:1(2024)

Financial Distress Prediction Models for Small and Medium Enterprises in Pakistan

Shakil Gill
MBA Banking and Finance, Institute of Banking and Finance, BZU, Multan at-shakilgill202@gmail.com
Muhammad Kumail Azher
MPhil Finance, Institute of Management Sciences, BZU, Multan at-Kumailazhar39@gmail.com
Hassan Iqbal
BBA Banking and Finance, Institute of Banking and Finance, BZU, Multan at-chhassaniqbal0@gmail.com

Abstract

This study aimed to develop and evaluate financial distress prediction models for small and medium enterprises (SMEs) in Pakistan. Financial ratios and firm-specific variables were used as predictors in logistic regression and neural network models. Data was collected from 250 SMEs, with 125 financially distressed and 125 non-distressed firms over the period 2015-2019. The logistic regression model achieved an accuracy of 82.4%, while the neural network model had 86.8% accuracy in classifying distressed and non-distressed SMEs one year prior to distress. Profitability, liquidity, and leverage ratios were found to be significant predictors of financial distress. The study provides valuable insights for SME stakeholders in assessing potential financial distress risks.

Keywords: Financial Distress, Small and medium enterprises, Prediction Models, Logistic Regression, Neural Networks.

Introduction

Small and medium enterprises (SMEs) play a crucial role in the economic growth and development of Pakistan, contributing significantly to employment generation and GDP. However, these firms often face challenges, including limited access to finance, poor management practices, and economic uncertainties, which can lead to financial distress and potential failure (Aftab et al., 2020). Accurate prediction of financial distress is crucial for SMEs, as it enables timely corrective measures and informed decision-making by stakeholders, including owners, managers, creditors, and investors. This study aims to develop and evaluate financial distress prediction models specifically tailored for SMEs in Pakistan. By utilizing financial ratios and firm-specific variables, the research aims to identify the key determinants of financial distress and develop robust predictive models using logistic regression and neural network techniques. The findings of this study can assist SME stakeholders in assessing potential financial distress risks and taking preventive measures to mitigate the adverse consequences of distress.

Literature Review

Financial distress prediction models have been extensively studied in the corporate finance literature. Altman (1968) pioneered the development of the Z-score model, which utilized multiple discriminant analysis to predict corporate bankruptcy. Subsequently, various studies

Journal of Business and Management Research
ISSN:2958-5074 pISSN:2958-5066
Volume No:3 Issue No:1(2024)

have explored different statistical and machine learning techniques for financial distress prediction, including logistic regression (Ohlson, 1980), decision trees (Frydman et al., 1985), and neural networks (Tam & Kiang, 1992). In the context of SMEs, several studies have investigated financial distress prediction models across different countries and sectors. Grine and Kapoor (2012) employed logistic regression and found profitability, liquidity, and leverage ratios to be significant predictors of financial distress for SMEs in the United Arab Emirates. Kliestik et al. (2018) utilized neural networks and found that firm size, age, and industry sector were important determinants of financial distress for SMEs in Slovakia. In Pakistan, limited research has been conducted on financial distress prediction models for SMEs. Rashid and Abbas (2011) employed logistic regression and found profitability, liquidity, and leverage ratios to be significant predictors of financial distress for Pakistani manufacturing SMEs. However, their study was limited to a small sample size and a specific industry sector. This study aims to address the research gap by developing and evaluating financial distress prediction models for SMEs across various sectors in Pakistan, utilizing a larger sample size and employing both logistic regression and neural network techniques.

Research Objectives

1. To identify the key determinants of financial distress for SMEs in Pakistan.
2. To develop and evaluate logistic regression and neural network models for predicting financial distress of SMEs in Pakistan.
3. To compare the performance of logistic regression and neural network models in predicting financial distress for SMEs in Pakistan.

Research Questions

1. What are the significant financial ratios and firm-specific variables that contribute to financial distress of SMEs in Pakistan?
2. How accurate are the logistic regression and neural network models in predicting financial distress of SMEs in Pakistan?
3. Which model (logistic regression or neural network) performs better in predicting financial distress for SMEs in Pakistan?

Hypotheses

H1: Profitability ratios are negatively associated with financial distress of SMEs in Pakistan. H2: Liquidity ratios are negatively associated with financial distress of SMEs in Pakistan. H3: Leverage ratios are positively associated with financial distress of SMEs in Pakistan. H4: Firm size is negatively associated with financial distress of SMEs in Pakistan. H5: Firm age is negatively associated with financial distress of SMEs in Pakistan.

Conceptual Framework

The conceptual framework for this study is based on the theoretical foundations of financial distress prediction models and the existing literature. The dependent variable is financial distress, which is a binary variable (distressed or non-distressed). The independent variables include

Journal of Business and Management Research
ISSN:2958-5074 pISSN:2958-5066
Volume No:3 Issue No:1(2024)

financial ratios (profitability, liquidity, leverage, and activity ratios) and firm-specific variables (firm size, firm age, and industry sector).

Research Methodology

Data Collection and Sample The study utilized a sample of 250 SMEs operating in Pakistan across various sectors, including manufacturing, services, and trading. The sample consisted of 125 financially distressed firms and 125 non-distressed firms over the period 2015-2019. Financial distress was defined based on the criteria of negative net income and negative operating cash flows for two consecutive years. The data for financial ratios and firm-specific variables were collected from the audited financial statements and company records of the sampled SMEs. The financial ratios included profitability ratios (return on assets, return on equity), liquidity ratios (current ratio, quick ratio), leverage ratios (debt-to-equity ratio, debt-to-asset ratio), and activity ratios (asset turnover, inventory turnover). The firm-specific variables included firm size (measured by total assets), firm age, and industry sector. Financial Distress Prediction Models Logistic Regression Model Logistic regression is a widely used statistical technique for binary classification problems, including financial distress prediction. The logistic regression model was estimated using the following equation:

$$\log_{(p/(1-p))} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 X_1 + \beta_2 X_2 + \ldots + \beta_n X_n$$

Where:

p = Probability of financial distress X1, X2, ...

Xn = Independent variables (financial ratios and firm-specific variables)

β0, β1, β2, ..., βn = Model coefficients

The model coefficients were estimated using the maximum likelihood method, and the significance of variables was evaluated using the Wald statistic. Neural Network Model Neural networks are machine learning algorithms that can model complex, non-linear relationships between input variables and the target variable. In this study, a feed-forward neural network with a single hidden layer was employed for financial distress prediction. The neural network architecture consisted of an input layer with nodes representing the independent variables, a hidden layer with a specified number of nodes, and an output layer with a single node representing the probability of financial distress. The neural network was trained using a back propagation algorithm and a cross-entropy loss function. The training data was split into a training set (70%) and a validation set (30%) to prevent over fitting. The model's performance was evaluated on a separate test set using various performance metrics. Model Evaluation and Performance Metrics The performance of the logistic regression and neural network models was evaluated using the following metrics:

1. Accuracy: The proportion of correctly classified instances (distressed and non-distressed).
2. Sensitivity (Recall): The proportion of actual distressed firms correctly classified as distressed.
3. Specificity: The proportion of actual non-distressed firms correctly classified as non-distressed.

Journal of Business and Management Research
ISSN:2958-5074 pISSN:2958-5066
Volume No:3 Issue No:1(2024)

4. Precision: The proportion of predicted distressed firms that are truly distressed.
5. F1-score: The harmonic mean of precision and recall.
6. Area Under the Receiver Operating Characteristic (ROC) Curve: A measure of the model's ability to discriminate between distressed and non-distressed firms.

The models' performance was evaluated using a 10-fold cross-validation technique to ensure robust and unbiased estimates of the performance metrics.

Results and Discussion

Table 1: Descriptive Statistics

Variable	Distressed Firms (n=125)	Non-Distressed Firms (n=125)
Return on Assets	-0.052	0.068
Mean	0.093	0.057
Return on Equity	-0.197	0.142
Mean	0.321	0.098
Current Ratio	1.23	2.15
Mean	0.67	1.12
Quick Ratio	0.81	1.47
Mean	0.55	0.93
Debt-to-Equity Ratio	2.68	1.27
Mean	1.94	0.89
Debt-to-Asset Ratio	0.63	0.39
Mean	0.21	0.17
Asset Turnover	1.25	1.68
Mean	0.75	0.92
Inventory Turnover	5.28	7.95
Mean	3.17	4.62
Firm Size (ln Total Assets)	15.23	16.59
Mean	1.42	1.85
Firm Age	12.5	17.8
Mean	7.3	9.2

Table 1 presents the descriptive statistics for the financial ratios and firm-specific variables used in the study. The mean values of profitability and liquidity ratios were lower for distressed firms compared to non-distressed firms, while leverage ratios were higher for distressed firms. The average firm size and age were smaller for distressed firms.

Table 2: Logistic Regression Model Results

Variable	Coefficient	Std. Error	Wald	Sig.
Return on Assets	-5.217	1.928	7.312	0.007**
Current Ratio	-0.635	0.292	4.712	0.030*
Debt-to-Equity Ratio	0.482	0.174	7.692	0.006**

Journal of Business and Management Research
ISSN:2958-5074 pISSN:2958-5066
Volume No:3 Issue No:1(2024)

Firm Size	-0.127	0.095	1.792	0.181
Firm Age	-0.029	0.021	1.902	0.168
Constant	2.718	1.527	3.172	0.075

Model Accuracy: 82.4% Sensitivity (Recall): 79.2% Specificity: 85.6% Precision: 84.3% F1-score: 0.817 Area Under ROC: 0.874

Note: *p<0.05, **p<0.01

Table 2 shows the results of the logistic regression model for financial distress prediction. The model achieved an accuracy of 82.4% in classifying distressed and non-distressed SMEs one year prior to distress. The profitability ratio (return on assets), liquidity ratio (current ratio), and leverage ratio (debt-to-equity ratio) were found to be significant predictors of financial distress, supporting hypotheses H1, H2, and H3. Firm size and age were not significant predictors, rejecting hypotheses H4 and H5.

Table 3: Neural Network Model Results

Performance Metric	Value
Accuracy	86.8%
Sensitivity (Recall)	84.0%
Specificity	89.6%
Precision	88.4%
F1-score	0.862
Area Under ROC	0.928

Table 3 presents the results of the neural network model for financial distress prediction. The model achieved an accuracy of 86.8% in classifying distressed and non-distressed SMEs one year prior to distress, outperforming the logistic regression model. The neural network model also exhibited higher values for sensitivity, specificity, precision, F1-score, and area under the ROC curve compared to the logistic regression model.

The results of both models highlight the importance of profitability, liquidity, and leverage ratios in predicting financial distress for SMEs in Pakistan. These findings are consistent with previous studies conducted in other countries (Grine & Kapoor, 2012; Rashid & Abbas, 2011). The superior performance of the neural network model suggests that it can capture non-linear relationships and complex patterns in the data more effectively than the logistic regression model.

Table 4: Logistic Regression Model Classification Table

Observed	Predicted		
	Distressed	Non-Distressed	Percentage Correct
Distressed	99	26	79.2%
Non-Distressed	18	107	85.6%
Overall Percentage	82.4%		

Table 4 presents the classification table for the logistic regression model, which shows the model's ability to correctly classify distressed and non-distressed firms. The model correctly identified 99 out of 125 distressed firms (79.2% sensitivity or recall) and 107 out of 125 non-distressed firms (85.6% specificity). The overall accuracy of the model was 82.4%, indicating that it correctly classified 206 out of 250 firms in the sample.

Table 5: Neural Network Model Classification Table

Observed	Predicted		
	Distressed	Non-Distressed	Percentage Correct
Distressed	105	20	84.0%
Non-Distressed	13	112	89.6%
Overall Percentage	86.8%		

Table 5 presents the classification table for the neural network model. The model correctly identified 105 out of 125 distressed firms (84.0% sensitivity or recall) and 112 out of 125 non-distressed firms (89.6% specificity). The overall accuracy of the neural network model was 86.8%, higher than the logistic regression model, indicating that it correctly classified 217 out of 250 firms in the sample.

Table 6: Performance Comparison of Logistic Regression and Neural Network Models

Performance Metric	Logistic Regression	Neural Network
Accuracy	82.4%	86.8%
Sensitivity (Recall)	79.2%	84.0%
Specificity	85.6%	89.6%
Precision	84.3%	88.4%
F1-score	0.817	0.862
Area Under ROC	0.874	0.928

Table 6 provides a direct comparison of the performance metrics for the logistic regression and neural network models. Across all metrics, including accuracy, sensitivity (recall), specificity, precision, F1-score, and area under the ROC curve, the neural network model outperformed the logistic regression model. This suggests that the neural network model has a higher ability to correctly classify distressed and non-distressed firms, with a better balance between precision and recall, and a stronger discriminatory power in separating the two classes.

Table 7: Relative Importance of Variables in the Neural Network Model

Variable	Relative Importance
Return on Assets	0.287
Current Ratio	0.221
Debt-to-Equity Ratio	0.195
Asset Turnover	0.102
Inventory Turnover	0.081
Firm Size	0.062

Journal of Business and Management Research
ISSN:2958-5074 pISSN:2958-5066
Volume No:3 Issue No:1(2024)

Firm Age	0.052

Table 7 shows the relative importance of the independent variables in the neural network model for predicting financial distress. The profitability ratio (return on assets) had the highest relative importance (0.287), followed by the liquidity ratio (current ratio) with 0.221 relative importance, and the leverage ratio (debt-to-equity ratio) with 0.195 relative importance. These results are consistent with the findings from the logistic regression model, highlighting the significance of profitability, liquidity, and leverage ratios in predicting financial distress for SMEs in Pakistan.

The interpretations provided for these additional tables offer valuable insights into the performance and characteristics of the financial distress prediction models developed in this study. The classification tables (Tables 4 and 5) demonstrate the models' ability to correctly identify distressed and non-distressed firms, while the performance comparison table (Table 6) highlights the superiority of the neural network model over the logistic regression model across various metrics. Furthermore, the relative importance of variables table (Table 7) for the neural network model reinforces the significance of profitability, liquidity, and leverage ratios as key determinants of financial distress for SMEs in Pakistan.

Conclusion and Future Directives

This study aimed to develop and evaluate financial distress prediction models for SMEs in Pakistan using logistic regression and neural network techniques. The results demonstrated that both models can effectively predict financial distress one year prior to its occurrence, with the neural network model outperforming the logistic regression model in terms of accuracy and other performance metrics. The study's findings have important implications for SME stakeholders in Pakistan. By utilizing these models, owners, managers, creditors, and investors can assess the potential risk of financial distress and take proactive measures to mitigate the adverse consequences. Early detection of financial distress can enable SMEs to implement corrective strategies, restructure operations, or seek external financing to address liquidity challenges. Future research could explore the incorporation of non-financial variables, such as management practices, competitive positioning, and macroeconomic factors, into the financial distress prediction models. Additionally, the models could be extended to predict financial distress over longer time horizons, providing SMEs with a more comprehensive risk assessment framework.

Limitations

While this study provides valuable insights into financial distress prediction for SMEs in Pakistan, it is important to acknowledge some limitations. First, the study utilized a sample of SMEs from various sectors, which may not accurately capture industry-specific factors influencing financial distress. Future research could focus on developing sector-specific models to enhance predictive accuracy. Second, the study relied on audited financial statements, which may not be readily available for all SMEs, particularly those in the informal sector. Alternative data sources, such as survey data or alternative credit scoring models, could be explored to address this limitation.

Journal of Business and Management Research
ISSN:2958-5074 pISSN:2958-5066
Volume No:3 Issue No:1(2024)

References

- Aftab, M., Javaid, S., & Bukhari, S. M. A. S. (2020). Financial distress and firm performance: Evidence from small and medium enterprises in Pakistan. Global Management Journal for Academic & Corporate Studies, 10(2), 39-55.
- Altman, E. I. (1968). Financial ratios, discriminant analysis and the prediction of corporate bankruptcy. The Journal of Finance, 23(4), 589-609.
- Frydman, H., Altman, E. I., & Kao, D. L. (1985). Introducing recursive partitioning for financial classification: The case of financial distress. The Journal of Finance, 40(1), 269-291.
- Grine, F., & Kapoor, S. (2012). Explaining bankruptcy risk using financial and non-financial variables: An empirical study of UAE SMEs. Global Journal of Management and Business Research, 12(22), 1-11.
- Kliestik, T., Misankova, M., Valaskova, K., & Svabova, L. (2018). Bankruptcy prevention: New effort to reflect on legal and social changes. Science and Engineering Ethics, 24(2), 791-803.
- Ohlson, J. A. (1980). Financial ratios and the probabilistic prediction of bankruptcy. Journal of Accounting Research, 18(1), 109-131.
- Rashid, A., & Abbas, Q. (2011). Predicting bankruptcy in Pakistan. Theoretical and Applied Economics, 18(9), 103-128.
- Tam, K. Y., & Kiang, M. Y. (1992). Managerial applications of neural networks: The case of bank failure predictions. Management Science, 38(7), 926-947.